

## **PRESENTERS**

### ***Rt Hon Justice Blanchard, Supreme Court***

Justice Blanchard holds LLM degrees from Auckland and Harvard Universities. He was a partner in the Auckland firm of Simpson Grierson and a director of several listed companies until his appointment to the High Court in 1992. He became a Judge of the Court of Appeal in 1996 and was appointed to the Supreme Court on 1 January 2004.

### ***Brendan Brown QC, Wellington***

Formerly a partner in Bell Gully, Brendan has practised as a barrister sole for 12 years, taking silk in 1997. His particular areas of interest are intellectual property law, trade practices and Treaty of Waitangi issues. He is a contributor to *McGechan on Procedure* and has participated in several NZLS seminars and training programmes.

### ***Greg King, Barrister, Wellington***

Greg is a criminal defence lawyer and has acted as counsel in many leading criminal cases in the High Court and the Court of Appeal. He recently obtained leave for convicted double murderer Bruce Howse to appeal to the Privy Council - a case considering the application of the proviso concerning the effect of miscarriage of justice. Greg has been a member of the Criminal Law Committee of the NZLS since 1999.

### ***Bill Wilson QC, Wellington***

Bill has had extensive experience in appellate advocacy as a partner in Bell Gully and since leaving the firm to practise as a barrister sole and taking silk in 1996. He has appeared in the Privy Council some 20 times and in the Court of Appeal on numerous occasions.

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

# CONTENTS

<b>1. CIVIL APPEALS</b>	<b>Brendan Brown QC And Bill Wilson QC</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction		1
Does an appeal lie from the High Court decision?		1
Is leave required?		3
Time limits		4
<i>Applications for leave to appeal</i>		4
<i>Appeal as of right</i>		4
Commencing an appeal		4
<i>Mode of commencement</i>		5
<i>Security for costs</i>		6
<i>Cross-appeals</i>		6
Progressing the appeal to a fixture		7
<i>Applications for fixtures</i>		7
<i>Points on Appeal</i>		8
<i>Points of cross-appeal/notice of intention to support judgment</i>		8
Selection of grounds of appeal		9
<i>Nature of judgment appealed from: constraints on scope of appeal</i>		9
<i>Findings as to credibility and reliability of witnesses</i>		9
<i>Findings as to a witness's state of mind</i>		11
<i>Distinguishing between findings of fact and inferences of fact</i>		11
<i>Findings of fact</i>		12
<i>Decisions of mixed law and fact / the application of a legal standard to facts as found</i>		14
<i>Decisions involving the exercise of a discretion</i>		16
<i>Issues of law – new points</i>		17
Case on Appeal		18
Chronology		19
Bundle of authorities		20
Fresh/updating evidence		20
General principles of appellate advocacy		22
Written submissions		23
Oral submissions		24
<i>Questions from the Bench</i>		25
<i>Reply by appellant</i>		26
<i>Golden rules</i>		26
<b>2. CRIMINAL APPEALS</b>	<b>Greg King</b>	<b>27</b>
Introduction		27
High Court – Appeals from the summary jurisdiction		27
<i>Case stated appeals – s 107 Summary Proceedings Act 1957</i>		28
<i>General appeals in the High Court</i>		29
<i>Appeals relating to suppression orders</i>		30
<i>Bail appeals (Bail Act 2000)</i>		30
Court of Appeal		31
<i>Taito &amp; Bennett</i>		31
<i>Changes occasioned by Taito</i>		31
Re-hearings		32
<i>Numbers of re-hearings (up to end of August 2004)</i>		33
Mode of hearing		33

Court of Appeal (Criminal) Rules 2001.....	34
<i>Applications for leave to appeal</i> .....	35
<i>Prosecutor appeal</i> .....	36
<i>Bail appeals</i> .....	37
<i>Summary proceedings appeal</i> .....	38
<i>General appeal</i> .....	38
<i>General appeal against conviction</i> .....	38
<i>Unreasonable verdict – section 385(1)(a)</i> .....	39
<i>Other grounds of appeal against conviction</i> .....	39
Miscarriage of justice v Substantial miscarriage of justice – the proviso.....	45
<i>Howse</i> .....	47
Sentence appeals .....	48
<i>Discount for guilty plea</i> .....	48
<i>Disparity</i> .....	48
<i>Minimum non-parole periods</i> .....	49
Supplementary powers on the hearing of appeals.....	49
Time limits.....	50
<i>Affidavit required where extension of time is sought</i> .....	51
<i>Filing of written submissions</i> .....	51
<i>Compliance with time-limits essential</i> .....	51
Criminal Legal aid – Court of Appeal .....	52
The Supreme Court.....	53
<i>Criminal Legal Aid – Supreme Court</i> .....	54
Prerogative of mercy – s 406 Crimes Act 1961 .....	54
Appellacacy.....	56
<i>Notice of Appeal</i> .....	57
<i>The written submissions</i> .....	58
<i>Oral submissions</i> .....	59
Conclusion .....	60

### 3. SUPREME COURT JURISDICTION AND PRACTICE

#### **Rt Hon Justice BLANCHARD ..... 61**

Jurisdiction.....	61
<i>Criteria</i> .....	62
<i>Arguability</i> .....	64
<i>Additional statutory prohibitions and restrictions</i> .....	64
<i>Other provisions permitting grant of leave</i> .....	68
Practice.....	69
<i>Counsel’s experience</i> .....	70
<i>Leave applications</i> .....	70
<i>Nature of argument on appeal</i> .....	71
<i>Citation</i> .....	71
<i>Precedent</i> .....	72

### 4. A COMMENTARY ON THE SUPREME COURT RULES

#### **Rt Hon Justice Blanchard ..... 73**

Objectives .....	73
General provisions .....	73
Applications for leave to appeal .....	74
<i>Time for applying</i> .....	74
<i>How application is brought</i> .....	74
<i>Content of application</i> .....	74

<i>Written submissions on leave applications</i> .....	75
<i>Amendment of grounds of intended appeal</i> .....	76
<i>Hearing on the papers</i> .....	76
<i>Oral hearing</i> .....	76
Appeals .....	77
<i>Order constitutes the appeal</i> .....	77
<i>Conditions and limitation of grounds</i> .....	77
<i>Stays</i> .....	77
<i>Security for costs</i> .....	77
<i>Case on appeal</i> .....	78
<i>Abandonment of appeal</i> .....	79
<i>Written submissions on appeal</i> .....	79
<i>Authorities</i> .....	80
<i>Judgment</i> .....	80
Intervenors .....	80
<b>APPENDIX 1. SUPREME COURT RULES 2004</b> .....	<b>81</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2. SUPREME COURT ACT</b> .....	<b>109</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3. CRIMES ACT 1961 SECTION 383A</b> .....	<b>113</b>
<b>APPENDIX 4. SUMMARY PROCEEDINGS ACT 1957 SECTION 144A</b> .....	<b>115</b>
<b>APPENDIX 5. CIVIL APPEALS FLOW CHART</b> .....	<b>117</b>
<b>INDEX OF CASES</b> .....	<b>119</b>