

PRESENTERS

David Burns, Barrister, Auckland

David specialises in family law. He presented the successful NZLS seminar on this Act last year and contributes to *Brookers* on the Property (Relationships) Act. David is currently Chair of the Family Law Section of the New Zealand Law Society.

Margaret Casey, Barrister, Auckland

Margaret is a barrister specialising in family law. She is also an experienced mediator, particularly of family property disputes. A former Chair of the Family Law Section, Margaret is a contributor to *Trapski's Family Law*. She has presented numerous seminars, conference papers and workshops for the New Zealand Law Society.

The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.

CONTENTS

1. THE CHANGES IN PRACTICE: SECTION 15 AND SECTION 18B	1
Section 15: Economic disparity	1
Introduction – Section 15: Down stream from the flood gates	1
Commentary – Section 15: Analysis of key issues	2
Section 15: Income	3
Section 15: Living standards.....	4
Section 15: Extent of disparity – is it significantly higher?	5
Section 15: Causal nexus	5
Section 15: Discretion to compensate.....	8
Section 15: Quantum	10
Making a Section 15 claim	14
Section 15: Applications for maintenance	15
Cases.....	15
Jurisdiction: Section 32	15
Section 15: Contracting out clauses.....	16
Section 21 Agreements	16
2. THE CHANGES IN PRACTICE: SECTION 18B – COMPENSATION FOR POST-SEPARATION CONTRIBUTIONS.....	17
Introduction – Section 18B.....	17
Section 18: Commentary	18
Section 18: What factors influence the exercise of discretion under this section?	20
3. THE CHANGES IN PRACTICE: TRUSTS.....	21
Introduction	21
Definition of beneficial interest	21
Issues	21
Crystallisation	22
Section 2: Definition of “property”	22
Section 9A.....	32
Section 10.....	32
Section 44C	34
Onus	36
4. THE CHANGES IN PRACTICE: SECTION 21 – SERIOUS INJUSTICE TEST.....	37
Introduction	37
<i>Kinniburgh v Williams</i>	37
<i>The Public Trust v Linda Jean Whyman</i> CA 76/04	37
<i>C v S</i>	37
<i>Harrison v Marshall</i>	37
<i>C v S</i> [2004] NZFLR 546	42
Conclusion.....	45
APPENDIX 1.....	47
Recent section 15 cases	47
Court of Appeal	47
High Court.....	47
Family Court.....	47
Summary of useful cases	47
<i>B v B</i> High Court, Auckland, CIV2001-4044028, 26 June 2003, Salmon J	47
<i>B v B</i> [2004] NZFLR 653	48
<i>Cunningham v Cunningham</i> High Court, Auckland, CIV 2003-404-002392, 28 November 2003, O’Regan J	49
<i>J v W</i> Family Court, Wellington, FAM-2001-085-00265, 18 October 2004, Ellis DCJ.....	50

<i>Southall v Southall Family Court</i> , North Shore, FAM-2002-04411347, 21 October 2004, Clarkson DCJ	50
<i>Woodman v Woodman Family Court Auckland</i> , FP004/598/02C, 28 July 2004, O’Donovan DCJ	50
APPENDIX 2	53
Economic Disparity Clauses (s 21 Agreements).....	53
Economic Disparity Adjustment	53
Additional payment.....	53
Overall division	53
APPENDIX 3: ECONOMIC DISPARITY – CASE SUMMARY TABLE (AS AT JUNE 2003).....	55
APPENDIX 3: ECONOMIC DISPARITY – CASE SUMMARY TABLE	56
Judgment Date	56
APPENDIX 4	57
CLAUSES FOR SECTION 21 AGREEMENTS INVOLVING TRUSTS	57
APPENDIX 5	59
<i>Public Trust v Whyman</i> CA 76/04, judgment delivered 17 December 2004, Anderson P, Hammond and William Young JJ	59
<i>Harrison v Marshall</i> CA 117/04, judgment delivered 10 December 2004, McGrath, William Young and Chambers JJ.....	60
<i>Nation v Nation</i> [2005] NZFLR 103	60
<i>Johns v Johns & Holloway</i> [2004] 3 NZLR 202	61
APPENDIX 6:.....	63
Example trust deeds for study.....	63
Deed 1.....	63
Deed 2.....	65