

PRESENTERS

Dan Parker, Parker and Associates, Wellington

Dan is a Wellington based civil litigator who specialises in construction (particularly in relation to leaky building cases), insurance and other civil disputes. Since late 2001, Dan and his team at Parker & Associates have handled the successful resolution of many large and complex multi-party leaky building disputes, acting mostly for owners but also for defendants.

Tim Rainey, Rainey Law, Auckland

Tim is a specialist commercial litigator with extensive experience in all aspects of commercial and civil litigation. He has a particular focus on building and construction disputes, commercial and contract disputes and insurance law. Tim is widely regarded as one of the leading practitioners in building and construction litigation. He has extensive experience in acting for plaintiffs and defendants involved in “leaky building” litigation and has particular experience in conducting complex proceedings on behalf of multi-unit developments.

Acknowledgement

The authors and NZLS CLE Ltd gratefully acknowledge the assistance of Bronwyn Hutchison (Parker & Associates) with the preparation of the booklet.

The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.

CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION – THE LEAKY BUILDING PROBLEM	1
TYPICAL FEATURES OF LEAKY HOMES	3
WHY DID THE PROBLEM ARISE?	3
2. LIMITATION.....	5
THE 10 YEAR LONG STOP LIMITATION PERIOD	5
ORDINARY LIMITATION PERIODS	10
<i>Claims in tort</i>	11
<i>Claims in contract</i>	13
<i>Vendor warranty claims</i>	13
<i>The Fair Trading Act</i>	14
STOPPING THE CLOCK – THE EFFECT OF THE WEATHERTIGHT HOMES RESOLUTION SERVICES ACT.....	14
3. FORUM OPTIONS.....	17
BACKGROUND.....	17
ELIGIBILITY	17
THE PROCESS AFTER ELIGIBILITY	19
ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES	21
THE FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE PACKAGE.....	22
4. GATHERING THE EVIDENCE.....	25
INTRODUCTION	25
INITIAL STEPS.....	26
COUNCIL’S FILE AND INFORMATION	27
OWNER’S INFORMATION	27
HISTORICAL INFORMATION.....	28
EXPERT EVIDENCE	29
<i>The role of the expert witness</i>	29
<i>What experts are required?</i>	29
<i>Appointment of the expert</i>	29
<i>Testing and investigations</i>	31
<i>Weathertightness expert</i>	31
QUANTUM EVIDENCE	32
THE WHRS ASSESSOR’S REPORT – IS IT ENOUGH?	32
THE TOPICS TO COVER.....	33
<i>What is wrong with the building?</i>	33
<i>Identifying the parties with potential responsibility</i>	33
DESIGN	34
CONSTRUCTION, SUPERVISION AND OBSERVATION	34
COUNCIL’S INVOLVEMENT – BUILDING CONSENT, INSPECTIONS AND ISSUING CCCs	35
COLLATING MATERIAL IN A USEFUL FORM	35
ISSUES FOR DEFENDANTS	36
EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION.....	37
OTHER EVIDENCE.....	38
5. DECIDING WHETHER OR NOT TO REPAIR.....	39
6. QUANTUM ISSUES	41
ASSESSING THE DAMAGES THAT CAN BE CLAIMED AND THE COSTS THAT CAN BE RECOVERED	41
DAMAGES FOR COSTS OF REPAIR OR LOSS IN VALUE	41
BETTERMENT	43
OTHER QUANTUM ISSUES	44
<i>Special damages</i>	44
<i>General damages</i>	45
STIGMA.....	46

7. LIABILITY ANALYSIS.....	49
IDENTIFYING THE RELEVANT PARTIES	49
ABILITY TO PAY	51
TERRITORIAL AUTHORITIES.....	51
<i>Development of the duty</i>	52
<i>Hamlin</i>	54
<i>Hamlin Court of Appeal</i>	55
<i>Hamlin Privy Council</i>	57
<i>Dicks v Hobson Swan Ltd (in liquidation)</i>	57
<i>Sunset Terraces and Byron Avenue</i>	59
<i>The principle established in Hamlin</i>	59
<i>Departure from the decision in Hamlin</i>	60
<i>The scope of the Hamlin duty</i>	60
<i>Commercial premises</i>	63
<i>Considering council liability in a particular case</i>	64
<i>Contribution between defendants</i>	65
<i>Summary</i>	66
LIABILITY OF DEVELOPERS.....	67
BUILDING CONTRACTORS AND SUB-CONTRACTORS.....	68
GUARANTEES AND WARRANTIES.....	70
LIABILITY OF DIRECTORS/EMPLOYEES	71
VENDORS	72
<i>Misrepresentation</i>	72
<i>Concealment</i>	73
<i>Cancellation</i>	74
<i>Contractual warranties</i>	74
<i>Was a consent required?</i>	75
<i>Summary</i>	76
DESIGNERS, ARCHITECTS AND ENGINEERS	77
<i>The duty</i>	77
<i>Assessing a claim against an architect/engineer</i>	77
<i>Initial design</i>	77
<i>Inspection</i>	78
<i>Practical completion certificates</i>	78
<i>Producer statements</i>	79
<i>Summary</i>	79
PRODUCT MANUFACTURERS.....	80
<i>Application of the duty</i>	82
<i>Summary</i>	83
8. PLAINTIFF RISK FACTORS.....	85
CAUSATION.....	85
ASSUMPTION OF RISK.....	87
CONTRIBUTORY NEGLIGENCE	88
FAILURE TO MITIGATE.....	90
9. BRINGING THE CLAIM.....	93
MAKING DEMAND	93
INITIATING THE CLAIM	93
HIGH COURT	93
WHRS	93
<i>Authority to bring a claim</i>	93
<i>Getting started</i>	94
<i>Applying for adjudication</i>	94
TRANSFER BETWEEN WHRS AND HIGH COURT.....	95
TRANSFER FROM HIGH COURT TO WHT.....	95
TRANSFER FROM WHT TO HIGH COURT.....	96
LIMITATION	96
WHERE SUBJECT MATTER OF THE CLAIM IS THE SUBJECT OF PROCEEDINGS IN THE COURT	96
10. THE POSITION OF RESPONDENTS IN THE WEATHERTIGHT HOMES TRIBUNAL....	99

ANALYSING THE CASE AGAINST YOU AND THE OTHER PARTIES.....	102
CONSIDERING THE PROSPECTS OF REMOVAL OR OTHER PROSPECTS FOR RESOLUTION.....	102
11. ALTERNATE DISPUTE RESOLUTION – MEDIATION AND JUDICIAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE	105
INTRODUCTION	105
ADVANTAGES	105
SPEED AND COST.....	105
CONFIDENTIAL AND WITHOUT PREJUDICE	106
FLEXIBILITY OF OUTCOME	106
PREPARATION FOR ADR.....	106
USUAL PROCESS AT MEDIATIONS	109
PROCESS AT JUDICIAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCES.....	109
SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS.....	111
12. RUNNING THE CASE – ADJUDICATION OR HEARING	113
EXPERT CONFERENCE	113
HOT TUBBING	113
13. MULTI UNIT PROPERTIES	115
14. COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES	117
WHAT REMAINS POSSIBLE FOR OWNERS OF LEAKY COMMERCIAL PROPERTY?	120
APPENDIX 1 - SAMPLE QUANTUM SCHEDULE	123
APPENDIX 2 - SAMPLE DEFECT SCHEDULE	125