

## PRESENTERS



### **John Hannan, Partner, DLA Phillips Fox, Auckland**

John specialises in employment law, education law and commercial litigation. Until 1988 he was a senior lecturer in the Faculty of Law, Auckland University. He has appeared in leading employment law cases in the Employment Court and Court of Appeal and regularly acts for primary and secondary schools and tertiary education providers.



### **Professor Paul Rishworth, Dean of the Faculty of Law, Auckland University, Auckland**

Paul has a long standing interest in the law relating to students' rights and the legal powers of schools, as well as in legal questions about schools' liability in negligence and under various statutes. He is a co-author of the OUP text *The New Zealand Bill of Rights*, 2003 and has written and presented seminars on education law since the beginning of the Tomorrows School regime in the early 1990s. He was foundation President of ANZELA in New Zealand, and has been a consultant on human rights issues to governmental agencies.



### **Patrick Walsh, Principal, John Paul College, Rotorua**

In addition to being a principal, Patrick is also a qualified lawyer. He is the author of *Educational Management and the Law* and co-author of *Schools go to Court* (Pearson Education). He is also: a former President of The Australia New Zealand Education Law Association (NZ Chapter), lecturer in Education Law at Auckland University, member of the SPANZ Executive and a member of the Disciplinary Tribunal of the New Zealand Teachers' Council.

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be related upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

# CONTENTS

<b>1. EMPLOYMENT LAW IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR.....</b>	<b>1</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	1
OVERVIEW OF EMPLOYMENT LAW IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR, AND SUMMARY OF RECENT LEGISLATIVE CHANGES .....	1
PARTICULAR PROBLEMS .....	3
<i>Fixed term positions – dangers of rollovers</i> .....	3
<i>Issues</i> .....	3
BAR RAISED FOR DISCIPLINARY PROCESS: <i>AIR NEW ZEALAND LIMITED V HUDSON</i> AND OTHER RECENT CASES.....	4
<i>103A: An objective test</i> .....	5
' <i>Would</i> ' v ' <i>Could</i> ' .....	5
<i>Factors to consider</i> .....	6
<i>The impact of good faith changes</i> .....	6
<i>Air New Zealand Limited v Hudson</i> .....	7
<i>Vigorous scrutiny of process even where 'old test' applied: Cliff: an Internet/email misuse case</i> .....	7
<i>Flaws in process</i> .....	8
<i>Lessons from Cliff</i> .....	8
<i>Fuiava v Air New Zealand Limited - a safety decision</i> .....	8
<i>X v Auckland District Health Board ("ADHB")</i> .....	9
MISCONDUCT, IN PARTICULAR REPEAT MISCONDUCT .....	10
<i>Disciplinary Process: PTCA and STCA</i> .....	10
<i>Disciplinary process: STCA</i> .....	11
<i>Warnings for misconduct</i> .....	11
<i>Dismissal after warnings for misconduct</i> .....	11
<i>Unrelated warnings</i> .....	11
<i>Misconduct and serious misconduct</i> .....	11
<i>Misconduct Outside the Workplace: "Conduct of a Nature tending to bring the profession into disrepute"</i> .....	12
COMPETENCY PROBLEMS, AND PERFORMANCE AGREEMENTS.....	14
<i>Competency problems – the CEA process and the unique dynamics of the Education Sector</i> .....	14
<i>National administrative guidelines ("NAGs")</i> .....	16
<i>New Zealand Teachers Council satisfactory 'teacher dimensions'</i> .....	16
<i>Attestation</i> .....	17
<i>The Principals' collective agreements - annual performance review</i> .....	17
<i>Competency and professional standards ("IPS")</i> .....	18
<i>Issues</i> .....	18
RESTRUCTURING.....	20
<i>Dealing with a surplus: Process</i> .....	20
<i>Process - Primary Teachers (including Deputy and Assistant Principal and other unit holders) Collective Agreement 2007-2010 (PTCA)</i> .....	20
<i>Attrition</i> .....	20
<i>Carrying out the needs analysis: Analysing school needs</i> .....	21
<i>Voluntary identification</i> .....	21
<i>Salary Protection: Units</i> .....	22
<i>Redeployment</i> .....	22
<i>Where school is decapitated but not reorganised (clause 17, Appendix 4 PTCA)</i> .....	23
<i>Process: Secondary teachers collective agreement ("STCA")</i> .....	24
<i>Issues: Restructuring</i> .....	24
<i>Consultation: Recent clarification in Aberhart</i> .....	26
PSYCHIATRIC / PSYCHOLOGICAL IMPAIRMENT AND STRESS .....	27
<i>Medical retirement</i> .....	28
'LIGHT DUTIES' FOR STAFF RETURNING FROM ACCIDENT OR ILLNESS – 'REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION':	
DEALING WITH INCAPACITY.....	29
' <i>Light Duties</i> '.....	29
' <i>Reasonable Accommodation</i> ' of disabilities .....	31
<i>Incapacity dismissals</i> .....	33

<b>2. SEARCH AND SEIZURE IN SCHOOLS .....</b>	<b>35</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	35
SOURCE OF THE SCHOOL POWER TO SEARCH .....	36
EXTENT OF THE POWER TO SEARCH.....	38
WHAT IS A REASONABLE SEARCH?.....	40
<i>Reasonableness at inception</i> .....	40
<i>Reasonableness in execution</i> .....	40
WHAT IS A SEARCH? THE USE OF DRUG-SNIFFER DOGS .....	41
DOG-SNIFFING A PERSON FOR DRUGS .....	47
<b>3. STAND DOWN, SUSPENSION, EXCLUSION AND EXPULSION FROM A STATE SCHOOL .....</b>	<b>49</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	49
THE KEY STATUTORY PROVISIONS .....	49
IS IT ROCKET SCIENCE? .....	52
THE STARTING POINT: THE RIGHT TO AN EDUCATION .....	53
THE INTERNATIONAL DIMENSION.....	53
THE PROVINCE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW .....	55
ISSUE 1 - THE QUESTION OF SUBSTANCE (OR “JURISDICTION-CONFERRING” FACT): IS THERE GROSS MISCONDUCT OR CONTINUAL DISOBEDIENCE AND IS IT A HARMFUL EXAMPLE? .....	57
ISSUE 2 - THE ULTIMATE DECISION: IF THERE IS GROSS MISCONDUCT, SHOULD THE PRINCIPAL/BOARD SUSPEND (OR STAND DOWN, EXPEL, OR EXCLUDE)? .....	62
ISSUE 3 - PROCESS OF DECIDING: HOW THE ABOVE TWO DECISIONS ARE MADE.....	65
<i>Other jurisdictional issues (I): Unlawful rules or policies</i> .....	69
<i>England</i> .....	70
<i>South Africa</i> .....	72
<i>United States</i> .....	72
OTHER JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES (II): JURISDICTION AFTER HOURS AND OUT OF SCHOOL GROUNDS.....	74
THE COURT OF APPEAL DECISION IN J V LYNFIELD HIGH SCHOOL BOARD OF TRUSTEES .....	77
<b>4. COLLEGE SPORT .....</b>	<b>81</b>
THE REASON FOR REGULATION IN THE FIRST PLACE.....	81
THE SCHEME OF SCHOOL SPORTING REGULATION .....	82
THE NEW REGIME .....	83
OVERSEAS LAW.....	84
<b>5. DECISIONS OF THE DISCIPLINARY TRIBUNAL OF THE NEW ZEALAND COUNCIL .....</b>	<b>87</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	87
STATUTORY ROLE AND AUTHORITY .....	87
<i>139AW Powers of Disciplinary Tribunal</i> .....	87
REPORTS AND COMPLAINTS TO THE NZTC .....	88
SERIOUS MISCONDUCT .....	89
TEACHERS’ CRIMINAL CONVICTIONS.....	91
<i>Making complaints</i> .....	92
QUASI-JUDICIAL BODY .....	93
DECISIONS OF THE DISCIPLINARY TRIBUNAL.....	93
<i>PRIVATE VS PUBLIC HEARINGS</i> .....	94
<i>Background</i> .....	94
LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK .....	94
<i>Sexual misconduct cases</i> .....	95
VIEWING ACCESSING AND POSSESSING PORNOGRAPHIC MATERIAL.....	97
DRIVING WITH EXCESS BREATH ALCOHOL AND OTHER RELATED OFFENCES .....	98
<b>6. GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT .....</b>	<b>101</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	101
<i>Theme 1</i> .....	101
<i>Theme 2</i> .....	101
<i>Theme 3</i> .....	102
<i>Defining the relationship</i> .....	103
<i>Board of Trustees delegation</i> .....	104
PROBLEM SOLVING .....	105

<i>Principal / board relationship issues</i> .....	105
PERFORMANCE CONCERNS .....	106
INDEPENDENT REPORT .....	106
CHECKS AND BALANCES .....	107
CHANGE MANAGEMENT .....	108
PRINCIPAL'S PERFORMANCE AGREEMENT .....	109
<i>Points to ponder 1</i> .....	109
<i>Points to ponder 2</i> .....	110
<b>7. PRIVACY ACT 1993.....</b>	<b>111</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	111
PURPOSE .....	111
<i>The twelve principles are:</i> .....	112
COMMENTARY ON PRIVACY PRINCIPLES .....	113
<i>Principle 1: Purpose of collection of personal information</i> .....	113
<i>Principle 2: Source of personal information</i> .....	113
<i>Principle 3: Collection of information from subject</i> .....	114
<i>Principle 4: Manner of collection of personal information</i> .....	115
<i>Principle 5: Storage and security of personal information</i> .....	115
<i>Principle 6: Access to personal information</i> .....	115
<i>Principle 7: Correction of personal information</i> .....	116
<i>Principle 8: Accuracy of personal information to be checked before use</i> .....	116
<i>Principle 9: Agency not to keep personal information for longer than necessary</i> .....	116
<i>Principle 10: Limits on use of personal information</i> .....	117
<i>Principle 11: Limits on disclosure of personal information</i> .....	117
<i>Principle 12: Unique identifiers</i> .....	117
THE PRIVACY ACT AND OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT.....	118
CASE STUDY .....	119
THE EDUCATION ACT 1989 AND OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT 1982 .....	121
SCHOOL DISCIPLINE AND THE PRIVACY ACT .....	122
PRIVACY OFFICERS .....	123
APPENDIX A .....	126
<i>Points to ponder 1</i> .....	126
<i>Points to ponder 2</i> .....	126
<i>Points to ponder 3</i> .....	127
<i>Points to ponder 4</i> .....	127
<i>Points to ponder 5</i> .....	128
APPENDIX B PRIVACY CHECKLIST.....	129
APPENDIX C REQUEST FOR PERSONAL INFORMATION .....	130
APPENDIX D ACCESS TO PERSONAL INFORMATION REQUEST.....	131
APPENDIX E CASE NOTES.....	132
<i>Case Note Annual Report 2003/04 (miscellaneous) [20004] NZPrivCmr5</i> .....	132
<i>Case Note 67571 [2005] NZPrivCmr4</i> .....	132
<i>Case Note 87892 [2006] NZPriveCmr16</i> .....	133