

## PRESENTERS

### ***John Hannan, Phillips Fox, Auckland***

John is a partner in Phillips Fox, specialising in employment law, education law, and commercial litigation, having until 1988 been a senior lecturer in the Faculty of Law, Auckland University. He has appeared in leading employment law cases in the Employment Court and Court of Appeal and regularly acts for primary and secondary schools and tertiary education providers.

### ***Paul Rishworth, Associate Professor, University of Auckland***

As well as his academic involvement, Paul practises as a barrister in the fields of public and administrative law and human rights. He is a co-author of a recent text, *The New Zealand Bill of Rights*, OUP, 2003 and has written on education law issues since the beginning of the “Tomorrow’s School’s” regime. Paul is the New Zealand correspondent for the Yearbook of Education Law, and was the foundation president of the New Zealand chapter of the Education Law Association established in 1998.

### ***Patrick Walsh, Principal, John Paul College, Rotorua***

Patrick is a member of the NZ Teachers’ Council and the immediate past president of the NZ Chapter of the Australia New Zealand Education Law Association. He has written extensively on education and the law, and has lectured in education law at ACE, Massey University and UNITEC.

#### **Acknowledgement:**

The authors gratefully acknowledge the contribution made to chapter four by Simon Mitchell and Paul Pa’u and to chapter five by Maria Kazmieron, all of Gubb and Partners, Auckland.

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

# CONTENTS

<b>1. EMPLOYMENT LAW IN THE PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION SECTOR .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction .....	1
Boards of trustees as employers; legislative and regulatory changes since 2001 .....	2
Education Act 1989 .....	2
State Sector Act .....	2
Employment Relations Act 2000 .....	4
Revisions to the collective employment agreements.....	4
Position of independent schools in employment matters .....	4
Dealing with poor performance.....	5
<i>General guidance on applicable standards</i> .....	5
<i>CEA clauses</i> .....	6
Practical suggestions for process.....	10
<i>Examples from cases</i> .....	11
Stress claims .....	14
Sexual predation – dealing with ancient allegations .....	18
Pornography or other offensive material on school computers .....	19
Proposed protection for cleaning/food/caretaking staff in employment relations law reform bill.....	21
General update on employment law issues potentially affecting schools .....	21
<i>Proposed changes to test for ‘justification’ of disciplinary or other action affecting staff</i> .....	21
<i>Whanau support in disciplinary and other procedures</i> .....	22
<i>Proposed changes to appointment of fixed term/temporary staff</i> .....	23
<i>Miscellaneous disadvantage grievances, mostly relating to appointments</i> .....	23
<b>2. LEGAL LIABILITY IN RELATION TO STUDENTS .....</b>	<b>25</b>
Introduction and general comments .....	25
<i>Liability implies responsibility and power</i> .....	25
<i>The positive dimension of avoiding liability</i> .....	26
<i>The legal structure of primary and secondary education</i> .....	27
<i>The international law dimension</i> .....	29
<i>Potential scope for school liability: overview</i> .....	29
The right to education (Part I: access and duration).....	31
Breach of the right to education (Part II: educational quality and character) .....	36
Common law liabilities for school performance in education .....	38
Safety issues: the duty of schools to keep students from harm .....	42
<i>School liability for sexual predation</i> .....	42
<i>School liability for negligence</i> .....	46
<i>Statutory liability under the Health and Safety in Employment Act 1992</i> .....	46
Liability under the Human Rights Act 1993 and New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990 .....	49
<i>The scheme of the Human Rights Act</i> .....	49
<i>How the Human Rights Act relates to the Bill of Rights</i> .....	49
<i>How the Human Rights Act relates to other legislation</i> .....	50
<i>How the Human Rights Act and Bill of Rights will work in most cases</i> .....	51
<i>Marlborough College and the amethyst pendant</i> .....	52

<i>The Muslim Prayer room</i> .....	54
<i>Liability under the Human Rights Act</i> .....	56
Who is liable in schools?.....	57
<i>Are Baigent actions for breach of the Bill of Rights available against school boards?</i> .....	57
Policies and their proper role.....	58
<i>Parental and student consent forms and disclaimers of liability</i> .....	59
<b>3. THE NEW ZEALAND TEACHERS' COUNCIL .....</b>	<b>61</b>
Introduction .....	61
<i>Purpose</i> .....	61
<i>Objectives</i> .....	61
<i>Functions</i> .....	62
<i>Powers</i> .....	62
Complaints procedure .....	63
<i>Sources of complaint</i> .....	63
<i>Council process on receipt of complaint</i> .....	64
<i>Limited authorities to teach</i> .....	65
Criminal convictions .....	66
Character and fitness to teach.....	66
<i>Criteria for consideration</i> .....	66
<i>Mandatory consideration</i> .....	67
<i>Minor conventions</i> .....	67
<i>Sensitive police information and red stamps</i> .....	68
Employers' obligations .....	68
<i>The New Zealand teachers council must be notified:</i> .....	68
<i>The New Zealand teachers council may be notified:</i> .....	68
<i>What matters should be reported?</i> .....	69
Teachers' obligations .....	69
Procedure for council hearings.....	70
Question and answer .....	70
<i>Teachers</i> .....	71
<i>Employers/professional leaders</i> .....	72
<i>Parents/members of the public</i> .....	74
<i>The Code of Ethics</i> .....	75
A code of ethics for New Zealand registered teachers .....	76
<i>Ethical principles</i> .....	76
<i>Code of ethics</i> .....	77
Cases related to draft code of ethics.....	79
<b>4. TEACHER DISCIPLINE SERIOUS MISCONDUCT .....</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>AND MISCONDUCT .....</b>	<b>81</b>
Introduction .....	81
Grounds upon which employment can be terminated .....	83
Grounds upon which decisions can be challenged .....	83
<i>Constructive dismissal</i> .....	84
<i>Procedural fairness</i> .....	84
<i>Substantive justification</i> .....	84
Onus of proof .....	84
The employer.....	85

Delegation .....	85
Policies and resolutions .....	86
Summary dismissal.....	86
Misconduct and serious misconduct.....	87
<i>Deliberate disobedience to a lawful and reasonable instruction</i> .....	87
<i>Violence and harassment</i> .....	87
<i>Breach of school rules / policies (also known as work rules)</i> .....	87
<i>Dishonesty</i> .....	88
<i>Absenteeism</i> .....	88
<i>Breach of implied terms or law of contract</i> .....	88
<i>Misconduct outside work</i> .....	89
<i>Insubordination</i> .....	89
<i>Other misconduct</i> .....	89
The test for serious misconduct.....	90
Procedural fairness .....	90
Justification .....	92
The disciplinary process and procedural fairness .....	92
<i>Preliminary enquiries</i> .....	93
<i>Notice to the employee of allegations</i> .....	93
<i>Notice of the likely consequences</i> .....	94
<i>Opportunity for the employee to respond</i> .....	94
<i>Unbiased consideration</i> .....	94
Warnings .....	95
<i>Content of the warning</i> .....	96
<i>Warnings procedure</i> .....	96
<i>Dismissal after warnings</i> .....	96
<i>Lapse of time</i> .....	96
<i>Unrelated warnings</i> .....	97
Suspensions .....	97
Decision to dismiss.....	97
The raising of new matters or adjournments .....	98
Dismiss on notice or without notice .....	98
Does it have to be after a sequence of warnings?.....	98
Does a court later substitute its own judgment for the board's? .....	98
What should I do if I now decide I want to take disciplinary action? .....	99
Why check employment agreement/policies? .....	100
Teachers council.....	100
Challenging conduct by way of personal grievance .....	100
What is a personal grievance.....	101
<i>Resolving personal grievances</i> .....	101
Mediation .....	101
Employment relations authority .....	102
Employment court .....	102
Court of appeal .....	102
<b>5. BULLYING IN SCHOOLS AND THE LAW .....</b>	<b>103</b>
Introduction .....	103
<i>Culture of cruelty - the nature of bullying</i> .....	103
<i>Size of the problem</i> .....	104
<i>Effects of bullying</i> .....	105
Obligations of schools to pupils .....	106

<i>Legal</i> .....	106
<i>Ethical</i> .....	109
Obligations of schools to teachers.....	110
<i>Legal</i> .....	110
Remedies for bullying .....	114
<i>Legal accountability</i> .....	114
<i>Practical anti-bullying strategies</i> .....	117
Case studies of bullying - options and advice .....	120
Conclusion.....	122
<b>6. FAMILY COURT ORDERS AND THE SCHOOLS RESPONSIBILITY AND RESPONSE.....</b>	<b>123</b>
Introduction .....	123
Guardianship, custody and access .....	123
<i>Guardianship</i> .....	123
Custody.....	124
Access.....	124
Guardianship rights .....	125
Religion .....	125
Photographs .....	125
School reports.....	125
Children's names.....	126
Child youth and family services and the police.....	127
<i>Visits by CYFS to interview children</i> .....	127
<i>Visits by police</i> .....	127
<i>Notification to the parents</i> .....	127
Counsel for the child .....	128
<i>What is counsel for the child?</i> .....	128
<i>How is the counsel for the child appointed?</i> .....	128
<i>Interviewing the child at the school</i> .....	128
Case studies .....	129
<b>7. INTEGRATED SCHOOLS.....</b>	<b>131</b>
Key features of the Private Schools Conditional Integration Act 1975 .....	131
Proposals for review .....	132
Integration agreements .....	133
Applications to increase roll numbers .....	133
Enrolment schemes for integrated schools.....	134
State funding of religious or other 'Special Character' schools, human rights implications .....	135
<b>8. SCHOOL ESTABLISHMENTS AND CLOSURES .....</b>	<b>139</b>
The legislation .....	139
Challenges to establishment or non-establishment of schools .....	140
<i>Mandatory and relevant considerations</i> .....	140
<i>Consultation</i> .....	140
<i>Zoning, designation and the Resource Management Act 1991</i> .....	142
<i>Refusals to establish</i> .....	142
Challenges to school closures.....	142
<i>Canadian school closure cases:</i> .....	145
<i>United Kingdom cases</i> .....	146

<b>APPENDIX 1 .....</b>	<b>147</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2 .....</b>	<b>151</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3 .....</b>	<b>155</b>