

The Bill of Rights Act – getting the basics right

INTRODUCTION	1
1. HOW TO INTERPRET AND APPLY THE BILL OF RIGHTS	3
Introduction	3
The Bill of Rights as benchmark	4
The need for evaluation	5
How to interpret the Bill of Rights	5
What are "rights"?	6
(a) <i>Rights as juristic constructs</i>	6
(b) <i>Rights as reasons</i>	7
The special character of Bill of Rights interpretation	9
(a) <i>Generous and purposive</i>	9
(b) <i>Purpose prevails</i>	9
(c) <i>Identifying purpose</i>	10
(d) <i>The purpose of the Bill of Rights as a whole</i>	10
(e) <i>Process-based interpretations</i>	11
Relationship between rights and limitations	12
(a) <i>Rights without inherent qualifiers: are they to be "definitionally balanced"?</i>	12
(b) <i>Conflicts between rights</i>	14
(c) <i>Rights with inherent qualifications</i>	15
(d) <i>Relation of common law rights to the Bill of Rights</i>	16
2. WHO DOES THE BILL OF RIGHTS APPLY TO?	19
Benefit, burden and territorial scope	19
The benefit of rights	19
The burden of the Bill of Rights	19
The legislative branch	20
(a) <i>Legislation as an "act done"</i>	20
(b) <i>No judicially enforceable obligations on the legislature</i>	20
Parliamentary privilege and the Bill of Rights	20
(a) <i>Is the House of Representatives included in s 3?</i>	21
(b) <i>Is judicial enforcement of the Bill of Rights possible against the House?</i>	22
Acts done under the authority of an enactment	23
Section 3(a): The executive branch	24
(a) <i>Relation between s 3(a) and s 3(b).</i>	24
(b) <i>The executive</i>	24
Public function imposed by law	26
(a) <i>What is a "public function, power or duty"?</i>	26
(b) <i>Bodies performing regulatory functions</i>	27
(c) <i>Private bodies offering parallel functions</i>	28

<i>(d) Utilities and monopolies</i>	28
<i>(e) Acts done "in the performance of"</i>	29
<i>(f) "Conferred or imposed by or pursuant to law"</i>	30
The judicial branch	31
<i>(a) "Acts done" by the judicial branch</i>	32
<i>(b) Common law and court orders</i>	32
<i>(c) Evaluating common law in private litigation</i>	34
3. INTERPRETING ENACTMENTS: THE ROLE OF SS 4, 5 AND 6	37
Role of ss 4, 5 and 6	37
The Bill of Rights and interpretation: an overview	37
The residual significance of common law interpretation method	38
The common law interpretation method	40
The Bill of Rights interpretation method	43
<i>(a) Moonen v Film and Literature Board of Review</i>	44
Is an alternative meaning possible?	46
<i>(a) The ambiguity threshold</i>	46
<i>(b) What counts as a "meaning"?</i>	47
Section 4	50
<i>(a) The scope of s 4</i>	50
<i>(b) The use of s 4</i>	50
Types of interpretation problems	51
<i>(a) Grammatical and linguistic ambiguity</i>	51
<i>(b) Statutes enacting discretionary powers of action or decision</i>	52
<i>(c) Enactments empowering delegated legislation</i>	53
<i>(d) Statutes with general standards and vague phrases</i>	55
Prescribed by law	57
4. REASONABLE LIMITATIONS ON RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS	59
The first task: defining the right	59
The second step: assessing justification under s 5	61
<i>(a) Is the limit prescribed by law?</i>	61
<i>(b) Rationality and proportionality - The Oakes test</i>	62
<i>(c) The Oakes test in New Zealand</i>	63
<i>(d) Reformulation of the Oakes test: Moonen v Film and Literature Board of Review</i>	65
5. IMPACT OF THE BILL OF RIGHTS ON POLICY DEVELOPMENT	67
The legal nature of the reporting duty and the status of s 7 reports	67
Reports to date	68
The role of counsel	69
6. FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION – SELECTED ISSUES	71
Defamation	71
Name suppression	74

Privacy	76
7. CRIMINAL PROCEDURE UNDER THE NEW ZEALAND BILL OF RIGHTS ACT 1990: AN OVERVIEW	79
Introduction	79
<i>(A) The exclusion of evidence obtained in violation of the Bill of Rights</i>	79
<i>(B) Section 21: The right to be free from unreasonable search or seizure</i>	85
<i>(C) Concepts of arrest, detention (under an enactment), offence and charge</i>	100
<i>(D) Section 22: the right not to be arbitrarily arrested or detained</i>	105
<i>(E) Section 23(1)(a): the right to be informed at the time of an arrest or detention under any enactment of the reasons for the arrest or detention</i>	106
<i>(F) Section 23(1)(b): the right to consult and instruct a lawyer without delay and to be informed of that right</i>	108
<i>(G) Section 23(3): the right of persons arrested for an offence and not released to be brought before a court or competent tribunal as soon as possible</i>	113
<i>(H) Section 24(d): the right of everyone charged with an offence to adequate time and facilities to prepare a defence</i>	119
<i>(I) Section 25(b): The right to be tried without undue delay</i>	126
<i>(J) Section 26(2): The right if finally convicted, acquitted or pardoned for an offence not to be tried or punished for it again</i>	127
Conclusion	128
8 REMEDIES	129
Judicial indications of inconsistency	129
The Human Rights Amendment Bill	132