

## CHAIR



### **Amanda Donovan, Haigh Lyon, Auckland**

Amanda leads Haigh Lyon's specialist family law team. Her practice covers all areas of family law with a particular focus on relationship property, trust issues, estate litigation and children matters. Amanda is a contributing author for the *Brookers Family Law – Child Law – Westlaw NZ* and while working in London, she was a consultant editor for *Hershman and McFarlane: Children Law and Practice*.

## SPEAKERS



### **Stephanie Ambler, Tompkins Wake, Hamilton**

Stephanie leads the family law team at Tompkins Wake. She specialises in family, matrimonial and trust law, particularly in the areas of relationship property disputes and claims against estates and trusts. Stephanie has presented a number of seminars.



### **Georgia Angus, Morris Legal, Auckland**

Georgia is a senior solicitor at Morris Legal. She began her career at Russell McVeagh and now applies her commercial experience and training to trust, estate and relationship property matters. Georgia advises private clients, charities and international and local trustee companies in relation to complex disputes.



### **Sharon Chandra, Turner Hopkins, North Shore City**

Sharon practises in all areas of family law, with a principal focus on relationship property, trusts and estate disputes. She has presented a number of legal seminars within the area of relationship property and published articles in several legal publications. Sharon has also been interviewed by various media outlets to comment on family law related issues.



### **Jennie Hawker, Wynyard Wood - City Office, Auckland**

Jennie is a partner at Wynyard Wood in the family law team. Her practice is primarily dedicated to relationship property issues with a strong litigation focus. Jennie is a contributing author to *Brookers Family Law – Child Law – Westlaw NZ* commentary, as well as having spoken for continuing legal education programmes on a number of topics.

## SPEAKERS



### **Isaac Hikaka, Lee Salmon Long, Auckland**

Isaac has particular expertise in disputes involving interactions between trusts and other areas of the law, including complex relationship property claims and international trust disputes. He regularly appears in cases in New Zealand and the Pacific Islands.



### **Shane Hussey, Hussey & Co, Auckland**

Shane is a chartered accountant who provides a range of litigation support services (eg business valuations, loss assessments). He has carried out numerous economic disparity calculations, pursuant to s 15, including for the wife in *X v X*.



### **Jeremy Johnson, Wynn Williams, Christchurch**

Jeremy is an experienced litigator and dispute resolution specialist. He has particular expertise in commercial, insolvency, equity and trust law. Jeremy is regularly involved in relationship property cases that have a trust element to them. He also has a particular interest in arbitration being a Fellow of AMINZ. Jeremy is a member of STEP and is recognised as being a leader in his field by the 2018 *Chambers Asia Pacific* and *Chambers Global* and recommended by 2017 Legal 500 global legal directories.



### **Sally Morris, Morris Legal, Auckland**

Sally is a partner at Morris Legal, is admitted as a Barrister and Solicitor in New Zealand, New South Wales and New York, and has a Master of Laws degree from Columbia University. She has an established reputation in the field of relationship property, trust and estate disputes, appearing regularly in the Family Court, High Court and Court of Appeal on behalf of trustees, beneficiaries, executors, charities and private clients.



### **Rod White, Hussey & Co, Auckland**

Rod is a financial analyst who focuses on the litigation support side of Hussey & Co. He has also carried out numerous economic disparity calculations and assisted Shane Hussey in the development of the *X v X* calculations.

# CONTENTS

In session order

## **Ménage à Trois**

Ménage à Trois – when does an affair become a de facto relationship? ..... 1  
*Georgia Angus & Sally Morris*

## **Constrictive Trusts: an update**

Constructive Developments in Property Relationship Law? The development of the  
constructive trust concept ..... 11  
*Shane Campbell & Jeremy Johnson*

## **Practical Tips and Tricks**

Tips and Tricks for Litigation – utilising the Family Court Rules to your advantage ..... 23  
*Amanda Donovan & Jennie Hawker*

## **The Latest Hits**

The Latest Hits: Case Law Update ..... 45  
*Sharon Chandra*

## **Scott v Williams – Economic Disparity – Part One**

*Scott v Williams*: the future of s 15 – clear as mud ..... 53  
*Stephanie Ambler*

## **Economic Disparity – Part Two**

Section 15 Calculations in light of *Scott v Williams* and a Comment on “Fair Value” ..... 73  
*Shane Hussey & Rod White*

## **Is It Actually a Trust?**

Is It Actually a Trust? ..... 95  
*Isaac Hikaka*

## CONTENTS

Alphabetical by author/presenter

<b>Author</b>		<b>Title</b>	<b>Page</b>
<b>Ambler</b>	Stephanie	<i>Scott v Williams – Economic Disparity – Part One</i>	53
<b>Angus</b>	Georgia	Ménage à Trois <i>Joint paper with Sally Morris</i>	1
<b>Chandra</b>	Sharon	The Latest Hits	45
<b>Donovan</b>	Amanda	Practical Tips and Tricks <i>Joint paper with Jennie Hawker</i>	23
<b>Hawker</b>	Jennie	Practical Tips and Tricks <i>Joint paper with Amanda Donovan</i>	23
<b>Hikaka</b>	Isaac	Is It Actually a Trust?	95
<b>Hussey</b>	Shane	Economic Disparity – Part Two <i>Joint paper with Rod White</i>	73
<b>Johnson</b>	Jeremy	Constructive Trusts: an update <i>Joint paper with Shane Campbell</i>	11
<b>Morris</b>	Sally	Ménage à Trois <i>Joint paper with Georgia Angus</i>	1
<b>White</b>	Rod	Economic Disparity – Part Two <i>Joint paper with Shane Hussey</i>	73

# CONTENTS

<b>MÉNAGE À TROIS – WHEN DOES AN AFFAIR BECOME A DE FACTO RELATIONSHIP? .....</b>	<b>1</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	1
THE LEGAL TEST .....	1
MULTIPLE RELATIONSHIPS .....	5
CONCLUSION.....	10
<b>CONSTRUCTIVE DEVELOPMENTS IN PROPERTY RELATIONSHIP LAW? THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CONSTRUCTIVE TRUST CONCEPT .....</b>	<b>11</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	11
TYPES OF CONSTRUCTIVE TRUST.....	12
HOW ARE CONSTRUCTIVE TRUSTS APPLIED NOW? .....	13
OTHER CLAIMS: RESULTING TRUSTS AND UNJUST ENRICHMENT .....	20
CONCLUSION.....	22
<b>TIPS AND TRICKS FOR LITIGATION – UTILISING THE FAMILY COURT RULES TO YOUR ADVANTAGE.....</b>	<b>23</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	23
USEFUL INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATIONS .....	24
A FEW COMMENTS REGARDING SPOUSAL MAINTENANCE PROCEEDINGS .....	28
WHERE TO FILE WHAT, WHEN AND PROCEDURE FOR TRANSFERS BETWEEN COURTS .....	30
SECURITY FOR COSTS .....	36
WITNESS SUMMONS .....	40
INTEREST PAYMENTS AND THE PRA .....	41
<b>THE LATEST HITS: CASE LAW UPDATE .....</b>	<b>45</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	45
<i>HORSFALL V POTTER</i> .....	45
<i>SCOTT V WILLIAMS</i> .....	47
<i>MCQUEEN V PENN</i> .....	48
CONCLUSION.....	50
<b><i>SCOTT V WILLIAMS</i>: THE FUTURE OF S 15 – CLEAR AS MUD .....</b>	<b>53</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	53
FACTUAL BACKGROUND.....	53
THE EVIDENCE.....	55
THE FAMILY COURT JUDGMENT .....	55
THE HIGH COURT JUDGMENT .....	56
THE COURT OF APPEAL JUDGMENT .....	57
THE SUPREME COURT.....	57
THE SUPREME COURT JUDGMENT.....	61
THE MAJORITY – A NEW FORMULA.....	62
OTHER POSSIBLE FORMULAS .....	63
IMPLICATIONS OF THE SUPREME COURT JUDGMENT .....	65
WHICH FORMULA DO WE APPLY? .....	70
<b>SECTION 15 CALCULATIONS IN LIGHT OF <i>SCOTT V WILLIAMS</i> AND A COMMENT ON “FAIR VALUE” .....</b>	<b>73</b>
SECTION 15 .....	73
“FAIR VALUE” .....	78
<b>APPENDIX A – DERIVATION OF S 15 CLAIM PER “CLASSIC” X V X APPROACH .....</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>APPENDIX B – DERIVATION OF S 15 CLAIM PER “UPDATED” X V X APPROACH.....</b>	<b>85</b>
<b>APPENDIX C – DERIVATION OF S 15 CLAIM PER INCOME DISPARITY ARNOLD APPROACH.....</b>	<b>87</b>
<b>APPENDIX D – DERIVATION OF S 15 CLAIM PER X V X ENHANCEMENT APPROACH.....</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>APPENDIX E – DERIVATION OF THE “FAIR VALUE” OF SUPER PROFIT STREAM .....</b>	<b>91</b>

**APPENDIX F – ADJUSTMENT TO DISCOUNT RATE AND EARNINGS MULTIPLE TO REFLECT A “FAIR VALUE” APPROACH..... 93**

**IS IT ACTUALLY A TRUST? ..... 95**

    INTRODUCTION ..... 95

    WHY DOES IT MATTER IF IT IS A TRUST? ..... 96

*PUGACHEV AND WEBB* ..... 96

    POTENTIAL DEPLOYMENT IN THE NEW ZEALAND CONTEXT ..... 100

    FINAL NOTE..... 102